Women’s Rights to Become Leaders of The Yogyakarta Sultanate Perspective of A Modern Democratic State

Muhammad Anwar Hidayat

Universitas Brawijaya, Malang, Indonesia; email : anwarfaizah@gmail.com

Abstract

The right of citizens, including women, to participate in the government of their country is a right guaranteed by the constitution. However, in Law Number 13 of 2012 concerning Privileges of the Special Region of Yogyakarta, this right is limited. Women seem to be hindered in their candidacy for governor and deputy governor of Yogyakarta. In subsequent developments that provision was finally nullified by a decision of the Constitutional Court. This will of course bring certain legal and political implications. Because of this, this article presents the legal aspects surrounding the decision, in particular the background, legal politics, and legal implications of the decision. The study found that the granting of the lawsuit had legal implications of opening up opportunities for women to become governors of DIY. This decision is based on the value of gender equality and the elimination of discrimination against women as well as recognition and respect for the special status of DIY which is also recognized by the constitution. Even though this decision still leaves pros and cons, this decision has been in line with democratic values and reflects the paradigm of gender equality and support for the gender mainstreaming movement in Indonesian politics.

Keyword
The Sultanate of Yogyakarta; Women’s Political Rights; Women’s rights; Political righ.
INTRODUCTION

Arrangements regarding political rights (the right to vote and be elected) of each person have been emphasized in Article 43 paragraphs (1), (2), and (3) of the Law of the Republic of Indonesia No. 39 of 1999 concerning Human Rights. Therefore, every citizen has the same rights without any restrictions, either directly or indirectly, in any form or in any way (Kumkelo, Kholis, & Ali, 2015).

The political right to be elected and vote means that every citizen is equally entitled to get his political rights to be elected as a leader, or executor of associations, organizations, or political parties. This is also confirmed by the Universal Declaration of Human Rights (UDHR) article 21 paragraph 1 which states that everyone has the right to participate in the government of their own country, either directly or through freely chosen representatives. In paragraph 2 it is stated that everyone has the right to equal opportunity to be appointed to a government position (Rohmah, Kholish, & Galib, 2022).

In the context of political rights as a regional head, Article 18 paragraph 4 of the 1945 Constitution of the Republic of Indonesia states that regional heads, including governors, regents, and mayors, are elected democratically. This refers to article 1 paragraph (2) of the 1945 Constitution of the Republic of Indonesia, “sovereignty is in the hands of the people and carried out following the Constitution” (Sodikin, 2014, p. 173).

In that article there is the right of the people to vote and be elected. If democracy is implemented, it will produce a government that is in accordance with the will of the people. As stated by Ivor Jenning democracy is defined as government of the people by the people and for the people and government with the people in running the country (Dahl, 2000, p. 8).

Democracy in Indonesia is empirically reflected in elections and regional head elections (Irmansyah, 2013, p. 104), including the election of governors and deputy governors who are directly elected by the people. However, the Special Region of Yogyakarta has a different mechanism from other regions in selecting governors and deputy governors. Regional heads are not directly elected by the people but are appointed by the kingdom to reign as Sultan Hemengku Buwono for governor candidates and reign as Duke of Paku Alam for deputy governor candidates.

Status as a Special Region has legal and political consequences, namely in the form of authority to regulate and manage its territory (state) under government supervision. This status was later recognized and given a “legal umbrella” by the founding father of the Indonesian nation, Soekarno (Kresna, 2011, p. 372). who is also domiciled “at BPUPKI and PPKI on August 19, 1945”. This stipulation charter was then submitted to Sri Sultan Hamengku Buwono IX and Paku Alam VIII on September 6, 1945. The contents of the stipulation
charter were, The Status Charter of Sri Paduka Ingkeng Sinuwun Kangjeng Sultan Hamengku Buwono IX, We, the President of the Republic of Indonesia, stipulate:


On August 30, 2012, Law Number 13 of 2012 concerning the Privileges of the Special Region of Yogyakarta was passed. This law refers to the state’s recognition and respect for the government system of the Yogyakarta Sultanate and its special or special units. This law also forms the basis and at the same time becomes the legal umbrella for the position of Sultan Hamengku Buwono as the Governor of DIY and Paku Alam as Deputy Governor. This position is supported by privileges in the field of land and spatial planning, privileges in culture, and institutionalization of the patrimonial bureaucracy. This places the Governor and Deputy Governor as an executive in a dominant position over the legislature which has an impact on the wheels of government in the Special Region of Yogyakarta.

But on the other hand, the law also creates controversy. The trigger was that the provisions in the conditions for candidates for Governor and Deputy Governor candidates were deemed to contain discrimination against women because they hindered women’s rights to become leaders. In the provisions of Article 18 paragraph 1 letter m it is stated that:

“The candidates for Governor and Deputy Governor are citizens of the Republic of Indonesia who must meet the following requirements:

m. submit a curriculum vitae which includes, among others, history of education, employment, siblings, wife, and children;”

The phrase “wife” in this provision seems to indicate that only men can become candidates for Governor and Deputy Governor. The polemic on this article has even reached the desk of the Constitutional Court. Several parties proposed reviewing the law against the 1945 Constitution of the Republic of Indonesia.

This polemic is considered contextual. Because currently, Sri Sultan Hamengku Buwono X as the sultan of the Ngayogyakarta Hadiningrat sultanate and the Governor of DIY Yogyakarta does not have male descendants. Many people consider that Sri Sultan Hamengku Buwono X himself has opened opportunities for women to become kings in the Ngayogyakarta Hadiningrat sultanate. Starting from changing the name of his eldest daughter, KR Pembayun to GKR
Mangkubumi Hamemayu Hayuning bawono Langgeng ing Mataram (Kusuma, 2015), Sri Sultan finally determined his eldest daughter to be the crown princess who would become the successor to the Ngayogyakarta Hadiningrat Sultanate (Winarno, 2015).

The polemic over the successor to the Ngayogyakarta Hadiningrat sultanate in a juridical context lies between women’s constitutional rights on the one hand and state recognition of the special status of the Special Region of Yogyakarta on the other hand, both of which are guaranteed by law. Therefore, this paper will examine this problem, especially from the perspective of a Democratic State.

**METHOD**

The study in this article is of the type of normative legal research because the study was carried out on legal materials in the form of laws and regulations and legal literature related to the issues studied (Soekamto & Mamudji, 2013, p. 13). The legal materials in question consist of primary and secondary legal materials. The primary legal material is in the form of laws and regulations that have authority in the form of laws and regulations and court decisions. Meanwhile, secondary legal material is in the form of scientific writings which contain basic legal principles and principles as reinforcement of the author’s arguments (Soekamto & Mamudji, 2013, p. 47). The analysis was carried out using a descriptive-qualitative approach. Legal materials that have been codified are analyzed to find general conclusions related to the legal problems or issues studied.

**RESULTS AND DISCUSSION**

**Legal Dynamics of Women’s Rights in The Leadership of The Yogyakarta Sultanate**

Restrictions on women’s rights as candidates for Governor and Deputy Governor of the Special Region of Yogyakarta are indeed a controversial legal issue. This provision is considered a form of state discrimination against women’s rights. Even though the 1945 Constitution of the Republic of Indonesia has guaranteed the right of society, including women, to participate in government. This limitation also contradicts Article 1 and Article 3 of Law (UU) Number 7 of 1984 concerning the Ratification of the Convention Concerning the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women (Convention on The Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women).

The provisions that are considered discriminatory are contained in article 18 paragraph 1 letter m which describes the conditions for candidates for Governor and Deputy Governor of Yogyakarta. The article reads:
“The candidates for Governor and Deputy Governor are citizens of the Republic of Indonesia who must meet the following requirements: m. submit a curriculum vitae which includes, among others, history of education, employment, siblings, wife, and children;”

Article 18 paragraph 1 letter m above can be understood that having a wife is a condition that must be attached to the candidacy of the Sultan who is enthroned to become Governor of the Special Region of Yogyakarta. This article is considered to give rise to the interpretation that only married men can become the Governor of Yogyakarta. Because a woman cannot attach a curriculum vitae containing the wife’s name (Mahkamah Konstitusi, 2016).

Article 18 (1) which contains gender restrictions is also considered a form of violation of the state’s recognition of the special status of the Special Region of Yogyakarta. Even though the recognition of the special status is stated clearly in Article 18B paragraph 1 UUD 45: “The state recognizes and respects regional government units that are special or special in nature which is regulated by law”.

The phrase “recognition and respect” means that the state legitimizes the existing government unit. This recognition is related to the five objects that make Yogyakarta special, as stated in the Yogyakarta Privileges Law (UU 13/1012) article 7 (2).

“Authorities in matters of Privileges as referred to in paragraph (1) include a. the procedures for filling the position, position, duties, and authority of the Governor and Deputy Governor; b. DIY Regional Government institutions; c. culture; d. land; and e. spatial”

Therefore the process of changing power is a matter that is included in the internal domain of the Yogyakarta palace and becomes the authority of the king’s autonomy as the holder of power. This authority must be respected and recognized by the state.

Because of this, the determination of gender requirements to occupy certain positions in DI Yogyakarta is a violation of the guarantees given by the constitution for regions with special status (Mahkamah Konstitusi, 2016, p. 163).

On this basis, several parties then proposed a judicial review of Law no. 13 of 2012 concerning the Privileges of the Special Region of Yogyakarta.

After going through the trial, the Constitutional Court finally decided to grant the plaintiff’s lawsuit regarding the requirements for the candidacy of the governor of Yogyakarta as outlined in Article 18 paragraph 1 point m Law 13/2012. Thus the constitutional court annulled article 18 paragraph 1 point M which stated the provisions for submitting curriculum vitae for candidates for governor and deputy governor.
In his consideration, the judge said that the restrictions on the parties mentioned in Article 18 paragraph (1) letter m were not based on the intention to fulfill fair demands based on considerations of morality, religious values, security, or public order in a democratic society. On the other hand, the judge still said, to fulfill just demands in a democratic Indonesian society, such restrictions should not occur. is legally justified.”

In other words, in a democratic Indonesian society, no moral ideas, religious values, security, or public order will be disrupted or violated if the parties mentioned in the article, including women, become candidates for governor or deputy governor in DIY.

Even more so if you consider DIY as a special region where the filling of the governor and deputy governor positions depends on the requirements of who is enthroned as sultan based on the internal law of the Ngayogyakarta Hadiningrat Sultanate, and who is enthroned as Duke, based on the internal law of the Pakualaman Kadipaten Palace.

Legal Politics of Women’s Rights in the leadership of the Sultanate of Yogyakarta after the Constitutional Court Ruling

Leadership succession occurred in the Sultanate of Yogyakarta and Pakualaman and was supported by a taxonomy of the Javanese system of power which was centered on a king. This has become a point of departure in the establishment and continuation of the specialties of DIY after Indonesia’s independence. Position charter was given by President Soekarno to Sultan Hamengku Buwono IX and Paku Alam VIII. This was later strengthened by Law Number 3 of 1950 which was a new departure for DIY with a special status. Even though the Sultanate and Pakualaman have become special regions, the government of the Republic of Indonesia still maintains Sultan HB IX and Paku Alam VIII in their positions. It’s just that the position is in its new form as Regional Head and Deputy Regional Head of DIY. This position and position continued to be attached to Sultan Hamengku Buwono IX and Paku Alam VIII until both died.

Even though there had been a shift as described above, in the following period the privileges related to the governor and deputy governor positions were consolidated again. This happened immediately after the election of Sultan Hamengku Buwono X as Governor of DIY and Paku Alam IX as Deputy Governor.

Furthermore, political dynamics occurred again. The tug of war between “Yogya” and “Jakarta” occurred when the privileges of DIY were reinterpreted and reconstructed through the Privileges Law.

The provision in the DIY Privileges Law which was annulled by the Constitutional Court is Article Article 18 paragraph (1) letter m which stipulates
the conditions for candidates for governor and deputy governor of DIY to submit a curriculum vitae which includes, among others, educational history, work, siblings, wife, and children.

There were 11 applicants for the judicial review. The Constitutional Court thinks that there is no constitutionally acceptable argument to justify the restrictions as stipulated in Article 18 paragraph (1) letter m of the DIY Privileges Law. “Restrictions on the parties mentioned in Article 18 paragraph (1) letter m of the DIY Privileges Law, including women, as candidates for Governor or Deputy Governor of DIY have nothing to do with the intent or purpose of guaranteeing the rights and freedoms of others,” said the judge of the Constitutional Court when reading out the considerations before making a decision.

According to the Constitutional Court, these restrictions are also not based on the intention to fulfill just demands based on considerations of morality, religious values, security, or public order in a democratic society. “On the contrary, it is precisely to fulfill fair demands in a democratic Indonesian society that such restrictions should not occur,” continued the judge of the Constitutional Court.

Because of this, the Constitutional Court considers that the request to annul the provisions of Article 18 paragraph (1) letter m of the DIY Privileges Law is very reasonable. “Given the request of the applicants in its entirety,” said Chief Justice of the Constitutional Court Arief Hidayat when pronouncing the decision on the judicial review of the DIY Privileges Law at the Constitutional Court building, Jakarta, Thursday (31/8).

The inclusion of the word ‘wife’ in the provisions of Article 18 paragraph (1) letter m of the DIY Privileges Law is controversial because it is the same as limiting the governor and deputy governor of DIY to only men. Because of this, the Constitutional Court considers these restrictions to be contrary to the 1945 Constitution.

“Declaring the phrase ‘which includes, among other things, educational history, work, siblings, wife and children’ in Article 18 paragraph (1) letter m of Law Number 13 of 2012 concerning Privileges of the Special Region of Yogyakarta is contrary to the Constitution of the Republic of Indonesia. The Republic of Indonesia in 1945 and has no binding legal force,”

The abolition of this provision indirectly opens opportunities for women to become governors of DIY. This also allowed the Sultan’s eldest daughter to become Governor.

However, on the other hand, this is also considered to be contrary to other provisions in the Yogyakarta Privileges Law. The brother of the King of
Yogyakarta Gusti Bendoro Prince Hariyo Yudhaningrat stated that:

“The governor is the king of Yogyakarta who reigns with the title Sampeyan Dalem Ingkang Sinuwun Kangjeng Sultan Hamengku Buwana Senapati-ing-Ngalaga Abdurrahman Sayidin Panatagama Khalifatullah Ingkang Jumeneng Kaping Sadasa ing Ngayogyakarta,”

According to Yudhaningrat, the title “Kalifatuloh” implies that a man must hold the position of the King of Yogyakarta. “So the decision of the Constitutional Court cannot be used as a basis for appointing the eldest daughter of Sultan HB X to become Governor.

The Position of Men in The Legal Culture of The Yogyakarta Sultanate

The position of men in the Sultanate of Yogyakarta is related to the legal culture within the Sultanate. As Friedman said, legal culture is one of the elements that make up the legal system. The legal culture of the Sultanate of Yogyakarta is also one of the elements that form the legal system of the Unitary State of the Republic of Indonesia.

Thus, Law Number 13 of 2012 concerning Privileges of the Special Region of Yogyakarta can be seen as a manifestation of the legal culture of the Sultanate of Yogyakarta within the legal system of the Unitary State of the Republic of Indonesia. The law is a regulation regarding the system of government in the Special Region of Yogyakarta which provides legal certainty for guaranteeing the existence of existing social, economic and cultural assets.

Culture is one of the main elements in the specialty of Yogyakarta which concerns creativity, taste, and intention both institutionalized in formal and non-formal institutions of the people of Yogyakarta. The three main elements from a cultural perspective in interpreting the Privileges of the Special Region of Yogyakarta are the Kraton as a customary institution that depicts noble works, the element of transforming modernity values through education, and the function of the Sultan as a cosmological mediator between the mission of the Islamic Empire and the reality of a pluralist society.

The Kraton in Law Number 13 of 2012 concerning Privileges of the Special Region of Yogyakarta is referred to as the Sultanate. One of the objectives of Law Number 13 of 2012 concerning Privileges of the Special Region of Yogyakarta is to institutionalize the role and responsibility of the Sultanate in maintaining and developing Yogyakarta culture which is the nation’s cultural heritage.

Law Number 13 of 2012 concerning Privileges of the Special Region of Yogyakarta has accommodated Sultan’s dual function as the head of the province, and the King as the highest authority in the kingdom whose job is to maintain and preserve traditions.

This is reflected in the definition of a sultanate, namely as a nation’s
Muhammad Anwar Hidayat
Women’s Rights to Become Leaders

cultural heritage which has been passed down from generation to generation and led by “Ngarsa Dalem Sampeyan Dalem Ingkang Sinuwun Kanjeng Sultan Hamengku Buwono Senapati Ing Ngalaga Ngabdurrakhman Sayidin Panatagama Kalifatullah”, who is usually called as Sultan Hamengku Buwono.

In addition, one of the conditions for becoming a candidate for Governor of the Special Region of Yogyakarta is to be enthroned as Sultan Hamengku Buwono. The role of leadership as part of the mechanism of power is not only determined by legal regulations, but also by the cultural values of a place. The legal system of a society does not only consist of substantive and procedural laws but also how the legal culture of a society can be a driving or inhibiting factor in the entire law enforcement process. (Thontowi, 2007, p. 28).

The title carried by Sultan Hamengku Buwono has been valid for generations starting from Sultan Hamengku Buwono I, Prince Mangkubumi. Prince Mangkubumi’s official title is Ngarsa Dalem Sampeyan Dalem Ingkang Sinuwun Kanjeng Sultan Hamengku Buwono Senapati Ing Ngalaga Kalifatullah Ngabdurrakhman Sayidin Panatagama Ingkang Jumeneng Ing Negari Yogyakarta Hadiningrat Ingkang Jumeneng Sepisan.

The title shows the role of the Sultan as a symbol of charismatic leadership cosmologically able to play the role of mediator of the two powers and powers which are reflected in the status and role of intermediaries. The status of the Sultan in the concept of Islamic power is Khalifatul fil Ardhi Sayidin Panotogomo (God’s representative on earth) who functions as a custodian of religious continuity and is a symbol of Islamic charismatic leadership. Normatively, the Sultan must be able to maintain his function transcendentally because he is a “representative of God”, who can also play a profane role in the realization of a socially and economically prosperous society (Thontowi, 2007, pp. 10–11).

What is interesting is the name change that the Sultan made through the “Dawuh” (order) he uttered on Tuesday 5 May 2015 (Agustina, 2015b). One of the important points of “Dawuh” was the removal of the title “Ing Ngalaga Abdurrahman Sayidin Panatagama Khalifatullah” (Agustina, 2015a). In the “Dhawuh” the name of Sri Sultan’s eldest daughter was also changed. “Gusti Kanjeng Ratu Pembayun” was changed to “Gusti Kanjeng Ratu Mangkubumi”. However, there was no further explanation from the Sultan whether the change in the name had implications for Pembayun’s appointment as crown princess. The Sultan believed that the change of name was a “dawuh” or an order from Allah through his ancestors; so it cannot be disputed, and can only carry out the “Dawuh” (Agustina, 2015b).

The strength of Islamic culture in the Sultanate of Yogyakarta is reflected in the historical position of men as Sultans (kings). This tradition has been going on for generations. When there is absolutely no direct male descendant
from Sultan Hamengku Buwono, then the younger brother of the Sultan will be appointed as the next Sultan. Sultan Hamengku Buwono VI, who reigned from 1855-1877 AD, became king in place of his older brother. This was because Sultan Hamengku Buwono V who ruled from 1823-1855 AD did not have a male heir (Kristanto, 2017).

The Kraton of Yogyakarta also had two Sultans at the same time. The surviving Sultan Hamengku Buwono VII handed over the throne to his son who became Sultan Hamengku Buwono VIII. The problem was then resolved through peaceful succession. Sultan Hamengku Buwono VIII finally decided to resign his position and leave the kingdom, living in the Ambarukmo area until the end of his life.

The legal culture of the Sultanate of the Special Region of Yogyakarta does not explicitly reject women becoming kings but is reluctant to accept women as kings. The reluctance of the legal culture of the Sultanate of the Special Region of Yogyakarta to accept women as kings is based more on the spirit of implementing Islamic law (fiqh) rather than Javanese tradition. In the tradition of the Yogyakarta palace, the king is usually the priest who leads the Friday prayers and delivers the Friday sermon. If the king is a woman, according to Islamic teachings, he cannot be an imam and khatib; so the needs of pisowanan or meetings cannot be fulfilled by a king.

With the removal of the title Ing Ngalaga Abdurrahman Sayidin Panatagama Khalifatullah, there is a fundamental change to the position of the Sultan. The Sultan does not have the role to be a regulator of religion in his territory. The title is a symbol that shows the manifestation of Islamic values which form the basis of the Yogyakarta Sultanate’s value system.

The “wahyu” (god’s message) received by Sultan Hamengku Buwono X and conveyed through the “sabda” (King’s Word) and “Dawuh” is believed to be the truth because it is transcendental. However, on the other hand, the revelation received by the Sultan should be able to create harmony, order, order, and happiness for humanity and the universe because as in the song Pangkur Serat Tajussalatin, a king must create harmony.

**Women’s Political Rights in the Perspective of a Modern Democratic State**

The role of women in politics is currently facing many obstacles. These obstacles arise from the cultural roots and values upheld in Indonesian society which is predominantly patriarchal. The systems and democratic values that enter Indonesia also experience complex dialectics. Democracy must deal with various Indonesian cultural values and also with Islamic values (Kholish & Yulianto, 2019). But women themselves must be optimistic and have a strong desire to enlarge their role there. It needs to be stated so that what is thought does not
only stop on the lips but can become a concrete activity. It is can start from a small movement and then gradually become a big movement that can free women from the shackles that prevent them from participating in politics. This is not something impossible but it is not simple and easy. It takes perseverance and courage to start and do it (Irwan, 1999).

In general, society thinks politics is a man’s business, politics is dirty, politics is hard, so women don’t need to be there. These views make very few women willing to pursue political careers, although it should also be noted that the number of women who used their votes in the last election was still quite high (Luth, Kholish, & Zainullah, 2018).

Therefore, a demand emerged to involve women in practical politics by setting quotas for women in the political structure. This is done because there is still an imbalance between the number of women voting and the number of women sitting in the legislature.

In the 1995 elections, the women who sat in the DPR were as follows. From Golkar 16.6%, PDI 10.9%, PPP 6.5%. In 1998, the women who sat in the DPR were as follows. From Golkar 13.3%, PPP 6.3%, PDI 15.5% (Endang Sumiarni, 2001:286). Although there are many demands to continue to encourage women’s participation in politics, the proportion of women sitting in the legislature and executive is not getting better. The fact is that the number of women sitting in the DPR, Provincial and Regency and City DPRDs, as well as among the bureaucracy, especially for echelon II, III, and IV, is still insignificant.

This reality shows that the number of women, both in the executive and legislative structures, is still disproportionate when compared to the number of women whose interests are represented. As a result, there are still many women’s interests that are not accommodated in government policies.

CONCLUSION

The Constitutional Court has granted the claim for the conditions for the nomination of the Governor and Deputy Governor of the Special Region of Yogyakarta contained in Article 18 paragraph (1) letter m of the Special Region of Yogyakarta Special Law. This condition opens opportunities for women to become governors of DIY. This decision is based on the value of gender equality and the elimination of discrimination against women as well as recognition and respect for the special status of DIY which is also recognized by the constitution. Even though the decision still leaves pros and cons, the decision has run in harmony with democratic values. The opening of opportunities for women to serve as Governor and Deputy Governor of DIY also reflects the paradigm of gender equality and support for the gender mainstreaming movement in political life in Indonesia.
REFERENCE


